



## THE SOCIAL SECURITY SYSTEM IN THE GRIP OF UNIVERSAL HUMAN RIGHTS AND COST: AN ASSESSMENT ON TURKISH EDUCATION SECTOR

Nejat İRA

Assoc.Prof.Dr, Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University, Faculty of Education, Çanakkale, Turkey  
Orcid: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2271-9353>  
[nejat.ira@gmail.com](mailto:nejat.ira@gmail.com)

Yeşim Atilla KÜROCAK

Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University, Faculty of Education, Çanakkale, Turkey  
Orcid: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4520-7094>  
[yesim\\_atlla@hotmail.com](mailto:yesim_atlla@hotmail.com)

Doğa Başar SARIİPEK

Kocaeli University, Faculty of Economics & Administrative Sciences, Kocaeli, Turkey  
Orcid: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3525-5199>  
[dsariipek@gmail.com](mailto:dsariipek@gmail.com)

**Received Date:** 17-10-2019

**Accepted Date:** 19-12-2019

**Published Date:** 31-12-2019

### Abstract

As in many countries, there is a pressure on social security system of Turkey to reduce overall costs and increase savings at the same time. While the private sector responds these pressures by increasing flexible and atypical working types as expected, surprisingly, the public sector increasingly applies similar strategies. In this context, the education sector is exposed to various employment reforms and regulations. In this sense, more unsecured practices such as paid teaching and fixed-term contracts are replacing indefinite term job contracts both in private and public sectors. The negative side of this process is the unequal dual structure where a group of teachers are employed under indefinite term job contracts with stable social security coverage and where even a larger group of teachers are employed with fixed-term job contracts and covered only within their teaching period. These teachers, who are excluded from formal right-based social security system, inevitably, replace traditional and informal social protection networks instead. Consequently, the education sector in Turkey has become one of the most vulnerable sectors, where people intensely use their informal networks to overcome the social protection crisis they face. Therefore, social security has lost its core feature of being a universal human right in Turkish education sector as confirmed by the qualitative research of this study. The findings portray that governments in Turkey are breaking away from rights-based social protection policies at least in education sector, and informal protection mechanisms such as familial solidarity and/or charity are getting stronger. In other words, charity-based social protection strategy has become the most common way to get access to social protection and to overcome the cost pressures in the social security system.

**Keywords:** The Social Security System, Universal Human Rights, Cost, Turkish Education Sector

### INTRODUCTION

In the last few decades, pressures to reduce costs in social security systems emerged significantly in many countries. Turkey, being harshly exposed to such pressures, has been undergoing a process of restructuring in all sectors, including education. To this end, flexible and atypical working types are expanding rapidly both in private and public schools under the claims of ‘employment reforms and regulations’. The most used strategy both in private and public sectors are pervasion of paid teaching practices or working with fixed-term contracts instead of indefinite term contracts. While the teachers who are employed under indefinite term contracts have a constant social security, paid teachers are only covered within the scope of their teaching period. The teachers employed with indefinite term job contracts in public schools are working even under the systems prevalent in private sector, and thus subject to significant cuts in their labor rights. Therefore, these teachers are actually reflecting the prevailing strategy of the governments against the problems faced by the Social Security System.

This teacher group, which is working with an amount of salary well-below the minimum wage and increasing in number, is devoid of any formal social security protection and most severely feels the



social insecurity. Since these teachers are excluded from formal and rights-based social security scheme, inevitably, they head for traditional and informal protection networks. In this sense, the most frequently taken precautions are accepting support from family, relatives, co-workers, neighbors and/or ask for assistance from civil society organizations, such as associations and foundations. To this end, Turkey has long been witnessing a process where informal social protection networks are extending to replace the formal schemes at least in education sector and it seems this is even encouraged by the government as well, as a tool to overcome neoliberal cost pressures on social security schemes.

Based on this claim, this study is an attempt to explain cost pressures and threats in formal social security scheme as well as the extension of insecure employment types in Turkey from the point of education sector and then to discuss the common self-coping with strategies of teachers as a response. What seems surprising here is that this existing structure flourishes not only in the private sector but also in the public sector as well; paid teaching along with fixed-term teaching contracts is the clearest indicator of these practices. The main reason behind this is that social security is not considered a universal human right but as a cost constraint by government.

While analyzing the interaction between formal and informal coping with strategies, this study is built on the opinions of teachers through several interviews. Put clearly, the study is based on semi-structured interview model and the qualitative research technique. In this context, seven paid teachers, both from private and public sectors, and eight fixed-term contract teachers are interviewed with. It is found that the perceptions of the paid and fixed-term teachers regarding social insecurity are far stronger and that they have had to apply to the informal security networks at least at one point in their lives. These results strengthen the claim that the government in Turkey is going away from right-based protection policies in social security, at least in education sector, and that they are increasingly replacing informal and charity-based protection mechanisms instead. As a result, this strategy constitutes the main struggle method against the cost pressures in the social security system.

This work, which discusses the regression in the quality of social security as a universal human right, is composed of three main sections. The first section presents the general theoretical framework and evaluates the social security as a universal human right. In the second section of the work, a brief history of education sector reforms in Turkey is discussed. As a result of these reforms and regulations that are more structured with the neoliberal point of views, there happens to be a regression in the social security rights of the teachers. As for the last section, it consists of the qualitative analysis conducted within the scope of work and obtained findings.

### **‘SOCIAL SECURITY’ AS A UNIVERSAL HUMAN RIGHT**

From the etymological sense, ‘social security’ is composed of the word ‘social’, which stands for the idea of belonging to a community or ensemble, and the word ‘security’, indicating safety or guarantee. Through the word ‘social’, the logic based on the principles of unity, equality, solidarity, and assistance come to one’s mind. On the other hand, the word ‘security’ reminds of the status of danger or threat. Combining them altogether, social security has the meaning of ‘the process of taking collective precautions against hazards’ (Yazgan, 1992: 17). From this point of view, public institutions regulated by the state are called ‘Social Security System’ which constitutes the protection of the individuals out of their own claim or will against some certain social risks by providing economic assurance and for the purpose of resolving the damages (Altın, 2010: 6).

Right of social security safeguards all necessary tools for meeting basic needs of all individuals and enabling their access to the basic services regardless of age, sex or working qualification. Put differently, everyone has the right of social security as human beings only and as a member of the society, they are living in without any other preconditions. This is a must for developing individuals’ dignity and personality. The guarantee which is going to be provided, ought to meet the



accommodation, nutrition, clothing, and medical needs of the individual or/ and his/her family. And specifically, social security must be provided in case of unemployment, disease, disability, single parenthood, old age, and deprivation of livelihoods. Besides, certain groups such as women, children, persons with disability, and other disadvantaged individuals should be protected and covered by all means (Alper, 2015: 200).

There are some key principles of human rights playing fundamental roles in guaranteeing the right of social security. The first one is the ‘inclusiveness’. Social security, to this end, indirectly covers all the risks faced by the individuals out of control that led the individuals to be deprived of means of subsistence. The second main principle is ‘flexibility’. What is meant by this principle is that the change in the age of retirement totally depends on the profession and the working abilities of older people with flexibly determined. Besides these personal facts, demographical, economic, and social factors are directly influential in the determination process of the age of retirement. The third main principle is ‘being indiscriminative’. Social security right must be provided to all regardless of any kind of discrimination based on grounds of health condition, race, age, sex, sexual orientation, disability, language, religion, nationality, income level or social status. This is a universal obligation.

The right of social security has been guaranteed by several global regulations such as Article 22 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Article 9 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights, Article 26 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child, Article 5 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, Articles 11 & 14 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, and Article 16 of the American Declaration on the Rights and Duties of Men.

As well as these articles, there are certain committees established in the United Nations and formed by experts that audit the implementation of certain human rights agreements. These committees follow the implementation of agreements in question by the help of regular reports sent by governments and publish their conclusions.

In the light of all these explanations, basic features of social security appear per se. Social security is an essential right which belongs to human beings, yet it is a liability attributed to the state. Informal relations, such as interpersonal solidarity and charity/philanthropy may contribute to the social security of the individuals. However, these are only expected to complete the state. Clearly, a close and strong cooperation should exist between formal and informal networks. As interplay between these two networks, social security appears to be a system which strives for preventing individuals from being damaged against their will. In case of damage occurs despite all the effort, it can be evaluated as a system which provides individuals to ‘regain the minimum working strength’ and ‘the guarantee of an income which is worth in human dignity’ (Doğan, 1999: 4).

As in many countries, social security system in Turkey is, however, under attack to reduce overall costs. The precautions taken against this pressure and the reforms launched are, mostly, in line with liberal approaches. In this sense, a qualitative and quantitative progress in terms of scope is not the first and the foremost purpose anymore. The most prominent outcomes of this process are more deregulated labor markets; increase in flexible and atypical jobs and, in general, a significant decline in the overall social protection levels of individuals. Inevitably, more precarious jobs, and thereby more insecure individuals and lifestyles occur in almost all aspects of societies as well. This process simply means a disengagement from rights-based protection approach and filling this gap with traditional and informal protection mechanisms, such as familial solidarity and charities.

### **Shift in Education Sector in Turkey and the Social Security Rights of Teachers**

Education sector in Turkey has been passing through a deep transformation process recently. In this process, the education life is restructured according to the market needs and the staff and curriculum



alteration are realized. In the financing of education, in particular, it is intended that non-governmental organizations such as family, civil society groups, and the private sector to be more active. Even, it is more clearly seen in the strategic plan which covers the 2015-2019 period of the Ministry of Education together with Ninth and Tenth Development Plan prepared by the State Planning Organization that the private sector is encouraged by the government to make more investments and it is going to be fostered by the state (Durmaz, 2014: 145). In the Ninth Development Plan, which covers the 2007-2013 period, it is explicitly stated that ‘the resources of the private sector are going to be oriented to the most-needed segments’. Some similar expressions are there in the Tenth Development Plan which covers 2014-2018. In this plan, it is pointed out that ‘the alternative finance models are going to be advanced in education and that the private sector is going to be tempted to initiate the educational institutions’.

A similar transformation is valid in terms of teachers. In a clearer expression, along with the restructuring process in education, the employment ways such as contracted and paid teaching are ever growing. Although contracted and paid teaching has taken place in legislation in the 1980s, starting from the 2000s, it has widely been used in filling the employment gap (Durmaz, 2014: 147). As a result of this process, there happened to be serious inequalities in the social security rights. In short, despite the fact that there are teachers who are working happily with their broad rights, there also exists another segment of unhappy teachers working with more restricted rights.

### **The Social Security of the Permanent Teachers**

The employees those are defined as the permanent teachers according to the Article 657 No. the State Law’s 4/A Article are people working as teachers. It is expressed that within the articles of the Civil Servants Law of the State numbered 657, the fail-proof working conditions and personal rights are broad (Alagöz, 2016: 25). According to the Civil Servants Law numbered 657, ‘utilities are undertaken by the officials, contractual staff, temporary staff, and workers’. In this regard, public employees, in the A subparagraph of the matter (4) ‘officer’, in the B subparagraph ‘contractual staff’, in the C subparagraph ‘temporary staff’, and in the D subparagraph ‘workers’ are separated (Keskin Demirer, 2012: 179). Those working in the 4/A cadre must not sign any other agreement once they are promoted until they quit the job (Kablay, 2014: 179). A successful public sector, the careers of the employees working in the sector in question, guarantees the emergence of some higher opportunities for the business relations and that of a safer job for the workers (14. ÇEKO Congress, 2012: 101).

Also, those employed in this status have the right to the paid vacation. Their marriage and death permission periods are longer than the teachers in the same status. In short, the teachers in this status have, in general, much more convenient working conditions and employment assurances. Further, when there is no annual record evaluation in the contractual, paid, and deputy teaching, there is an annual record evaluation of the teachers working in 4/A status and this has a direct impact on its advancements in the profession (Alagöz, 2016: 26).

One must need to meet some criteria in order to become a permanent teacher in Turkey. At the beginning of these comes 4 years of bachelor degree, and then a candidate must be successful at Public Personnel Selection Examination (KPSS) which is conducted centrally and nationally and become a teacher intern for a specific time. Briefly, holding a bachelor degree from a relevant faculty is not enough to be permanent, and many visible and invisible obstacles should also be breached.

Consequently, due to all these impediments, there are many unemployed teachers that are excluded from the public sector. These teachers have to be employed in the education institutions either private or in privately-owned etude centers in a much more unfavorable condition. Inevitably, this case leads to marketization of teaching and even abuse of the profession without being able to get the return of their labor and qualification.



## **THE SOCIAL SECURITY OF THE TEACHERS IN THE PRIVATE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS AND THE PAID TEACHERS**

Nowadays, there is a comprehensive restructuring process in Turkey in the sphere of education. In this process, on one hand, the education system is subject to some changes regarding its purpose, structure, and routes and on the other hand, the policies that aim at increasing the role of the private sector stand out. The most radical change in the education sector is that the schooling has remarkably increased in recent years. An inevitable conclusion of this increase in the number of the private schools is that the number of the educators working in this field has also gone up. This transformation in the education sector has led to many adverse results in the sphere of the social security (Alagöz, 2016: 2). In this scope, there has been either a regression or a complete disappearance of many basic legal rights. More importantly, a distinction between the teachers in terms of status such as ‘happy minority’ and ‘unhappy majority’ has sharpened. Most of the unassigned teachers, on one hand, are preparing for the next examination by attending KPSS courses and on the other hand, both to be exempted from internship and in order to make little income, they have been looking for jobs in etude centers, and private lesson offices. Many unemployed teachers could not find a place for themselves in the public sector or the educational institutions except for schools. This has rendered the field open to the subcontracts to teachers and exploitation of the teachers’ labor.

The teachers who are looking for opportunities for jobs outside the formal education system, in which they ‘failed’ to enter, and more importantly, the teachers who are open to accept the hard working conditions to maintain their lives under the mentioned circumstances are becoming the focus of the pressures coming from various quarters (Keskin Demirer, 2012: 178).

Thus, the application of the part-time temporary staff employment in the educational institutions related to the Ministry of Education has been legalized by the decision of the Council of Ministers on 29 January 2003 vide No. 2003/5213. By this application, the temporary educational staff has been employed according to the provisions of social security scheme and hourly salary. This situation points out the fact that the teachers in the public institutions are also working in comparatively negative circumstances just like the teachers working in the private institutions and, therefore, there happens to be a convergence between the public and private sector teachers in a lower standard.

The temporary teachers almost do not have any of the social security rights that are available to the permanent and the contractual teachers. For instance, when the temporary teachers get sick and if their illnesses last longer than a week, their contracts can be countermanded. In such a situation, the teachers whose contracts are countermanded have to wait until the education year to come to an end.

It can be said that the temporary teachers that are seen as the contractual and temporary staff in the law, albeit they are not regarded as ‘workers’ in the law, as of their personal rights are placed in a more recessive position than workers. Another important reflection of the subcontracted employment methods of the teachers has become more visible by the changing employment ways and the working conditions and at the beginning of them comes the emergence of the rivalry among the teachers from different categories (Keskin Demirer, 2012: 179). Now, the name of the temporary teachers, who are employed in devoid of any kind of security, has changed and instead of the profession of teaching, which rings the bell of extremely significant values, the new adjectives such as ‘master instructor’, ‘instructor’, and ‘language instructor’ are derived. With the staff appointed in this way, ten months contract is agreed for a year, the yearly vacation right is not given, their salaries are deducted even when they have reported, their candidacy to the unions are banned and they are employed as unsecured (Eğitim Sen, 2007: 3-4).

The teacher that is working in a private college sometimes works twelve hours a day and sometimes more than seventy hours in a week inside or outside the college. The college teachers, along with the normal courses, answer the questions of the students in a marketing method called ‘one by one’ and in



spare time they tend to spend them in preparing questions, and answering question sessions that have become compulsory (Keskin Demirer, 2012: 178).

Consequently, the analysis of the problems faced in the social security system illustrates us that a new structuring intended for the system should be in the way that the social protection must be defined on the grounds of a right related to citizenship; the union organization problems must be exceeded as a primary element in the development of the social security, and it must be uttered that the risks are to be avoided rather than be compensated; the social insurance and the social grants must be perceived as a whole, the social security must be stayed up with the fight against unemployment and employment policies, the unregistered employment must be recorded, and lastly the social security system must not be used as a tool of political populism (Gökbayrak, 2010: 159).

In order to strengthen ‘to be a better teacher’, enthusiasms of the teachers and the teacher candidates, the social sensitivity ought to be highlighted in the sphere of the teacher unemployment. Improvement of the social conditions and the importance given to educate the qualified teachers together with the enrichment of the employment prospects will relatively descend the importance of the external foci that are to be blamed. In this context, the person will head for explaining the failure directly with her/himself and the future is going to be handed in the palms of the competent teachers (14. ÇEKO Congress, 2012: 978).

### **Aim of the Study**

The main purpose of this research is to examine the social securities of the paid teachers that are working in the private schools and the public schools compared to that of the permanent teachers. At the same time, the conclusions of the reforms rendered in the education system in terms of the social protection rights are also going to be evaluated. In the light of these evaluations, a decision is going to be made in the fields of the education quality and whether there is a regression in the values attributed to the teaching profession.

Answers are sought after in line with these purposes.

1. What kind of differences are there, in terms of economic income and other resources, between the temporary teachers employed in the public and private schools and the permanent teachers?
2. What are the reasons for the teachers that prefer working temporarily in the public or private schools?
3. Are there conditions that make these teachers unhappy in their working environments?
4. What are the jobs and actions done by the teachers although not included in the definition of their jobs?
5. Is there a difference between the working hours and other conditions of the temporary teachers employed in the private and public sectors compared to the permanent teachers?

### **Method of the Study**

This is a descriptive research done in the qualitative scanning method for the purpose of analyzing the social security problems of the temporary teachers employed in the private and public schools compared to the permanent teachers. The qualitative research can be described as an approach which is based on interviewing, observing, obtaining data by using the qualitative data gathering methods such as participant observation and documents, and searching, fathoming, and interpreting the social phenomena within their own peripheries (Alagöz, 2016: 40).

The semi-structured interview form is used in the conducted work. Interviewing is undertaken with the data gathering process via verbal communication way. The working group of the research is composed of 15 teachers that are employed in the private and public schools located in Izmit province which is the central province of the city of Kocaeli in 2016-2017. Seven teachers are employed in the private



schools as the contractual teachers and eight of them are permanent teachers in the public schools. During the selection of the teachers, terms such as sex, age etc. is not taken into account. It is paid heed to that there is diversity. Gathering the research data is realized through the means of the semi-structured interview form. The semi-structured interview form is obtained from Irem Alagöz's 2016 master thesis titled 'The Problems of the Teachers Employed in the Private Schools in the context of Divided Labor Market'. The interview form is composed of six chapters and 45 questions. The first two of these chapters are the ones where the personal information and educational backgrounds of the teachers are explained. As for the third and the fourth chapters, they are aiming at detecting the working conditions of the teachers. And, the fifth and the sixth are the chapters where the future expectations and the ideas in emotional means of the teachers are taken.

Necessary explanations are done to the teachers prior to the interview. It is guaranteed that no personal information is going to be used. Also, the information regarding the names of the schools where they are working is obscured. For this reason, coding intended for the persons are used. The interviews are done, one- to-one, in March and April in 2017.

The interview information done with 15 teachers are evaluated by using the descriptive data analysis methods which is one of the qualitative data analysis techniques. The data used are resolved by being loyal to the originals, as much as we can, or direct quotations method.

### **Findings and Suggestions**

In this chapter, there are interpretations according to the obtained conclusions at the end of the evaluation process by using the semi-structured interview forms and interviewing the temporary school teachers in the private and public schools.

### **FINDINGS REGARDING THE TEACHERS' DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION**

#### ***Sex, Age, Marital Status***

The dispersion of the teachers by percentage of their sexes in the working group is shown in Table 1. 13% the teachers are female and, 2 of them are male. Their rates in total are 86.66% and 13.34% respectively.

**Table 1.** The Dispersion of the Participants by Sex

| Sex    | N  | %      |
|--------|----|--------|
| Female | 13 | 86.66  |
| Male   | 2  | 13.34  |
| Total  | 15 | 100.00 |

With regard to making a general assignation, it is possible to conclude that the profession of teaching is traditionally regarded as the female profession and this understanding still continues.

The dispersion of the participants by their ages is shown in Table 2. According to Table 2, the working group consists of 11 (73.33%) teachers who are younger than 30, and 4 (26.67%) teachers are older than 30.

**Table 2.** The Dispersion the Participants by Age

| Age              | N  | %      |
|------------------|----|--------|
| 30 years younger | 11 | 73.33  |
| 30 years older   | 4  | 26.67  |
| Total            | 15 | 100.00 |



The fact that there are fewer people employed older than 30 years of age indicates that the older teachers are less preferred. Usually, the institutions tend to choose the teachers that are young, newly-educated, dynamic, technology literate, and someone who would be up-to-date. For this reason, it is harder to employ teachers that are older than a certain age.

**Table 3.** The Dispersion of the Participants by Marital Status

| Marital Status | N  | %      |
|----------------|----|--------|
| Married        | 5  | 33.33  |
| Single         | 10 | 66.67  |
| Total          | 15 | 100.00 |

The dispersion of the participants by marital status is given in Table 3. According to Table 3, the working group consists of 10 single (66.67%) and 5 married (33.33%) teachers.

### **Findings regarding the Educational Background of the Teachers**

The dispersion of the participants according to their educational backgrounds is given in Table 4. According to Table 4, 13 (86.66%) of them hold bachelor degrees and 2 (13.34%) of them hold bachelor degrees but studying their masters.

**Table 4.** The Dispersion of the Participants by their Educational Backgrounds

| Educational Background | N  | %      |
|------------------------|----|--------|
| Bachelor               | 13 | 86.66  |
| Master                 | 2  | 13.34  |
| Total                  | 15 | 100.00 |

The departments of graduation of the participants also differ from each other. According to Table 5, 3 (20%) of them are from Pre-School Teaching, 2 (13.33%) from Classroom Teaching, 2 (13.33%) Theology, 1 (6.66%) Turkish Language and Literature, 1 (6.66%) Social Services, 1 (6.66%) Social Sciences Teaching, 1 (6.66%) Computer Teaching, 1 (6.66%) Math, 1 (6.66%) Psychology, 1 (6.66%) Sports Sciences, and 1 (6.66%) Math Teaching graduates.

**Table 5.** The Dispersion of the Participants by their Graduation Departments

| Departments                     | N  | %      |
|---------------------------------|----|--------|
| Pre-School Teaching             | 3  | 20.00  |
| Classroom Teaching              | 2  | 13.33  |
| Sports Sciences Teaching        | 1  | 6.66   |
| Math Teaching                   | 1  | 6.66   |
| Social Sciences Teaching        | 1  | 6.66   |
| Computer Teaching               | 1  | 6.66   |
| Theology                        | 2  | 13.33  |
| Social Services                 | 1  | 6.66   |
| Math                            | 1  | 6.66   |
| Psychology                      | 1  | 6.66   |
| Turkish Language and Literature | 1  | 6.66   |
| Total                           | 15 | 100.00 |





The rates of graduates from the Faculty of Education and the Faculty Science- Literature are close to each other. This indicates that the graduates from the Faculty of Science-Literature heading for teaching. And, they do it by taking formation courses or, rather, without having a certificate, in the public schools as the temporary teachers.

### **The Views of the Teachers regarding the Working Conditions**

The salaries paid to the teachers vary from an institution to another one. The difference between the salaries is much more evident in the private schools. The salaries of the temporary teachers employed in the public schools are calculated on the basis of course hour. That is equal to some of the very low salaries; however, there are not numerically gaps among the temporary teachers.

**Table 6.** The Dispersion of the Participants by their Monthly Incomes

| Monthly Income   | N  | %      |
|------------------|----|--------|
| 500 TL-950 TL    | —  | —      |
| 951 TL-1500 TL   | 8  | 53.33  |
| 1501 TL-2000 TL  | 3  | 20.01  |
| 2001 TL-2500 TL  | 2  | 13.33  |
| 2501 TL-3000 TL  | 2  | 13.33  |
| 3001 TL and more | —  | —      |
| Total            | 15 | 100.00 |

The dispersion of the participants by their monthly incomes is given in Table According to Table 6, 8 (53.33%) of the participants have incomes between 951 and 1500 TL, 3 (20.01%) of them between 1501 and 2000 TL, 2 of them (13.33%) between 2001 and 2500 TL and, 2 of them (13.33%) between 2501 and 3000 TL. If we are to consider the fact that the minimum wage in Turkey in 2017 is net 1404 TL, we can assert that the salaries of the teachers are revolving around the minimum wage.

### **CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS**

In the result of the research, some problems are revealed such as the teachers working in the private schools are deprived of the social rights compared to the teachers enrolled in the public schools and that they are employed like the temporary workers and that they cannot get paid for their labors and they have to accept the low salaries they are given. When their monthly incomes are observed, generally there is piling between 950 and 1500 TL. It is seen that the temporary teachers are mainly the majority. This figure is a little bit higher in the private schools.

One of the participants EA (35) explains the situation as follows:

Because we are employed by hourly salary, we are not paid for the course that we do not attend. Of course, I do not find this salary enough, yet I prefer getting paid regularly although it is low.

SP (37) also explains the situation as follows:

I do not think that my salary is enough. I think that the hourly salary must be calculated differently for 'the temporary teachers' and to detect this salary a decision is made and it has not been worked on. If a regulation is arranged, the factor would be determined.

The newly-graduated teacher candidates, firstly, aim at working in the public institutions. In order to do so, they attend the KPSS courses during the senior year of their studies. However, in the result of the growing number of the Faculties of Education and the decreasing number of promotions rendered the employment in the public sector hard. Serious efforts and works are, therefore, necessary. In the conducted research, it is revealed that all the participants prefer the private sector and the temporary teaching because they are not assigned.



SC (33) explains the situation as follows:

I think that the merits must be taken as a base for the conditions of the assignment of the teachers. I work as a temporary teacher. Although I do the same job with the permanent teachers, my salary is 1/3 lower than theirs and my insurance is indicated to be for 17-18 days.

The most important drawback of indicating the monthly working period is, as it is the instance above, paying the social security prims incomplete instead of 30 total days. Consequently, the retirement wage is calculated low. So, the social security problems that the temporary teachers face today lead to more grave results in future when they are retired.

Another problem with the private school teachers is related to their vacation. We can observe that they cannot fully utilize their compassionate leave, which is given officially in case of death, marriage and birth, where the administration comes up with various excuses. The administration sometimes shortens this period and, as a different approach, even deducts from the wage bill. When this is the case, the teachers, most of the time, have a problem with the administration and they give up on their rights.

YK (26) explains the situation as follows:

I was told that my marriage leave would be only 3 days and I did not have any vacation for honeymoon. Even, I got reactions as I did not consult the institution authorities while planning my wedding date. As a consequence, my leave days for honeymoon were deducted from my salary.

YA (24) explains his/her situation as follows:

Yes, there are deductions. For instance, when I went to hospital my wage was cut.

The situation of the temporary teachers working in the public institutions is much less worrying. Because the teachers are paid according to their working hours, they are not paid in their absent days. In this situation, the number of people who are deemed to be problematic has become limited.

In the interviews, when the teachers are asked 'are there things that you do although it is not in your duty description', it is seen that most of the teachers conduct other kinds of things that are not included in their job descriptions out of the fear of losing their jobs or coercion of the administration.

HA (26) explains the situation as follows:

Because I am employed as a temporary teacher, although I am not obliged to do so, I mounted guard couple of times.

SC (33) says:

I conduct things such as handing the students to the services, feeding them and etc.

YS (23) says:

Yes there has been. I helped in self-care things out of shortage of staff.

AM (30) answers:

I accepted the students out of field into my class.

Along with these, they also suggested that they were doing marketing jobs and they were not paid extra for these. The teachers in the private institutions have the right to go to strike, legally, convene a union and be a member of a union. However, out of the fear of losing their jobs, the private school teachers cannot fully benefit from their rights. Thus, the answer to the question 'is there a community organization of which you are a member' has been 'no'.



Also, there is a parallelism between the performance of the teachers and their salaries; in private education institutions, each teacher strives to win recognition and therefore, this causes a devastating competitive environment. The weakening of the human and social relations among the teachers and the decrease in information sharing are some of the problems that often surface. There are different answers to the question asked to the participants ‘what kind of a solidarity and competition relation do you see among the teachers’. For instance, HÇ (26) says that ‘this attitude can vary from person to person. There are very benevolent colleagues as well as ones with the attitude of competitive ambition’.

SP (37) argues the situation as follows:

I think that the teachers are competing in Transition from Primary to Secondary Education Exams (TEOG) more than the students.

In most of the teachers, it is predominated that in spite of all the conditions and problems, the teachers have the emotion of loving their professions and jobs. Although the motivation factors of their jobs are low and it results in preventing them from attaining their vocational satisfaction, there are also motivating elements such as ‘naivety and purity of the children’, ‘the job location is close to home’ and ‘positive feedbacks from parents’.

Besides, again the fear of losing their job is a prominent problem. It creates a grave concern that the private school teachers are working within the annual agreements and another critical concern for the temporary teachers that are working in the public institutions reasoning that an arrival of a permanent teacher may jeopardize their places. When this is the situation, there is no future expectation of the teachers. The teachers who cannot foresee their futures cannot get into the great expectations for their futurity. Thus, most of the answers support this idea. Here are the answers to the question of ‘are you concerned of losing your job’.

HA (26) answers:

Yes, I work intensively. I have to do each of my plans. I always feel as if I am living this life imperfectly.

EA (35) answers:

I am always more intensely worried in each re-location due to my marital status and I feel it in each holiday of mine.

YS (23) answers:

I sometimes experience this. That’s why I also have to accede with the working conditions that I dislike.

Consequently, it is seen that the numbers of the teachers graduated from the Faculty of Education and the Faculty of Science-Literature are close. Although the private schools exude that they are paying attention to selecting the graduates from the Faculty of Education, yet it turns out to be actually not the case. It is also observed that there are teachers employed who even do not hold any teaching certificate. It is seen that the teachers are doing things that are not specified in their job descriptions.

Besides, the obtained results indicate that the group that chooses to work as the permanent teachers is generally composed of the females. The main reason for this is to create an additional financial contribution, to save allowances or, their will to evaluate the spare time when the teachers do not work. And the main reason why it is not preferred by the males is that the salaries are well-below than the level that is enough to support a family. Thus, the salaries of the temporary teachers are even below the minimum wage.



The research findings show that the majority of the teachers are not members of the unions and civil organizations. Also, the private schools tend to raise the profits by employing teachers with low salaries. It is concluded that the monthly salaries of the private school teachers are somewhere between 1500 and 2000 TL. This same situation is estimated to be between 950 and 1500 TL for the temporary teachers employed in the public sector.

The promotion of the teachers employed in the private schools is directly proportional to experience. Despite the fact that there is solidarity among the teachers, there is also a rivalry.

There are some improvements in the education sector in terms of physical conditions day by day; the schools are fairly supported in terms of classroom size, course materials, and the technology used and it is striven to maintain and improve the educational level in the absence of such variables and types of equipment. However, there is an important point that should not be ignored. In spite of all these advancements in terms of physical conditions and educational materials, instead of a rise there is a decline in the education level. The PISA results, where Turkey has been attending since 2003, clearly show that the education level decreases more and more. Actually, there is a small increase in the results from 2003 to 2015. However, the results in 2015 are even behind 2003. Turkey has been the only country whose points drop fast.

It is seen there lays the fear culture under the conditions that require the teachers to be responsible of the technical things in the schools and those teachers' human relations deteriorate for they are dealing with photocopy jobs in their spare times and their sharing both vocational and daily lives decrease (Alagöz, 2016: 76). It is seen that the majority of the teachers aim at becoming permanent teachers against the private school working conditions. Right after their graduation, they take the KPSS examination and there are some who try it once or twice. Consequently, under the peripheries it gets harder and harder to become a permanent teacher in the public schools and the competition environment rises. Furthermore, there is no correlation between the students graduated and employed.

To summarize, the flexible and atypical working types in Turkey's education sector are ever pervading. This leads to a visible regression in the social security and the protection levels of the teachers. It is tried to stop this regression from the social security mechanisms that are traditional such as family solidarity and charity/philanthropy and community-based. For this reason, the social security is not described as a universal human right in Turkey, and it is only seen from the cost window. A fundamental principle such as 'while decreasing the costs, not causing any kind of regression or loss in universal rights' is not realized.

Recommendations that are claimed in the light of these findings can be listed as follows:

- The conditions of the contractual teachers employed in the private schools and the temporary teachers working in the public schools should not be lower than that of the teachers employed in the public schools permanently.
- The salaries of the teachers must be paid as equivalent to their labors and in line with the legal regulations. Its audit is to be done by the Ministry of Education.
- Repressive, illicit, and unqualified vocational elements such as in-class supervision, late-night sessions, summoning to the schools in spare times, and not leaving the schools within the working hours should be abolished (Alagöz, 2016: 79).
- The social rights of the teachers working in the private schools, contractually, and in the public, temporarily, should be improved.
- All the teachers should be kept under the same status and the discrimination among the teachers should be eliminated.



- No matter how the teacher is employed, a common minimum wage should be prescribed.
- More scanning works intended for identifying the problems in the social securities of the teachers should be undertaken.

## REFERENCES

- Alagöz, İ. (2016). The Problems of the Teachers Working in the Private Schools in the context of the Divided Labor Market, Master Thesis, Ankara University, Ankara, 2016
- Alper, Y. (2015), the Social Security Right and the Funding of the Social Security, VII. Social Human Right Symposium, 2015
- Altın, İ. (2010). The Social Security System and the Analysis of the Turkish Social Security System, Master Thesis, 2010
- Aydoğan, E. (2008). The Restructuring and the Privatization Steps in the Education System, Homeland, Politics, Governance, 2008, Vol. 3, No. 6, pp.166-187
- Doğan, M. S. (1999). The Ottoman Social Security Institutions in terms of the Social History, Sakarya University Press, No. 41, Sakarya, 1999
- Durmaz, O. S. (2014). Being a Teacher in Turkey, Nota Bene Press, 2014, pp.304 Education Union, The Privatization Application Report in Education, 2007
- Gökbayrak, Ş. (2010). Work and Society: The Transformation of the Social Security in Turkey, Ankara University, 2010, pp.141-162
- Kablay, S., A. (2014). Look at the Flexibility in the Public Employment, Universal Culture Library, Istanbul, 2014, pp.158-184
- Keskin Demirer, D. (2012). The Marketization in Education and the Transformation in the Teacher Labor, Kocaeli University, 2012
- Türk-İş (1992). 14. Congress of Working Economy and Industrial Relations, Istanbul University, 2012 Yazgan, T., The Social Security Notes for the Economists, Kutuyay Press, Publication No. 12, Istanbul, 1992